

1. Introduction:

- 1.1 This report has been prepared by Doug Evans BES BArch AAGradDipl for the Brockton Heritage Committee.
- 1.2 This report has been prepared in response to an application for permission to carry out alterations to a designated heritage property under the Ontario Heritage Act.

2. Information:

Location: 120 Cayley Street, Walkerton.

Date of construction: 1883, extended 1889.

Legal status: Designated heritage property as By-Law 81-16 dated 27th April 1981.

Land use zoning: Was "Institutional". Now "Mixed Use Commercial/ Residential"

Historical background: The church building dates to 1883 with the construction of the marl brick Chapel. The much larger red brick and fieldstone addition was built in 1889 and is considered to be "Walkerton's finest example of local vernacular architecture". The addition draws inspiration from the works of William Morris and the architect Philip Webb and shows clear links to the early Arts and Craft movement in Britain, and as a result should be considered one of the finest examples of its type in the South Bruce-Grey region, if not in western Ontario. The church also has historical links to Donald Sinclair, the first Speaker in the Parliament of Ontario.

The windows of both the 1883 Chapel and 1889 Church are original. The windows of the 1889 Church retain much of their original Arts + Craft glass.

Applicant's details: Robert Fischer
412 Concession 10 East, Mildmay, ON

Drawings: None submitted with application, though several brochure illustrations were included of suggested window/door treatments.

3. Current Application dated 1st June 2020.

The current application is for permission to carry out alterations to the exterior of the building as follows:

1883 Chapel Building

- 3.1 Entrance door to the Cayley Street (south) elevation of the 1883 Chapel building: Replace 'modern' metal door with new door; illustration included with application.
- 3.2 Double height lancet window to the Cayley Street (south) elevation of 1883 Chapel building: Install new secondary glazing to exterior of window. The applicant has also applied for a grant to repair this window.
- 3.3 Three lancet windows to west elevation of 1883 Chapel building: Replace original wood double-hung sliding sash windows with new vinyl double glazed windows. Replace cills. Illustration included with application.

1930s North Extension:

- 3.4 Alterations to the 1930s (?) extension to the north of the 1883 Chapel building:
 - Replace existing vinyl siding with new vinyl siding.
 - Replace existing aluminum trim capping to windows with new aluminium.
 - Replace northern window on west elevation with new larger window.
 - Replace southern window on west elevation with new entrance door opening.
 - New steps and landing at new entrance door to west elevation.
 - East elevation: New double French doors to replace exiting single door; illustration included with application.
 - East elevation: Construction of new external raised timber deck.

1889 Church Building:

- 3.5 Windows to the north, east (Jackson Street) and south (Cayley Street) elevations of the 1889 Church building: Install new secondary glazing to exterior of all windows.
- 3.6 Existing entrance door to east (Jackson Street) elevation of 1889 Church extension: New hand railings to existing steps.
- 3.7 Existing entrance doors to the Cayley Street (south) elevation of 1889 Church extension: Replace existing door glazing with etched Christian Cross design, with new plain glazing.
- 3.8 Existing steps to main Cayley Street entrance of 1889 Church extension: Construct new steps and access ramp.

- 3.9 New external lighting: Install new recessed lighting in “soffits” as follows:
- Cayley Street (south) elevation.
 - West elevation.

Recommendations

4. Recommendations.

Recommendations and reasons for them are given as follows:

1883 Chapel Building

- 4.1 Entrance door to Cayley Street (south) elevation:

Recommendation: A ‘modern’ subframe has been inserted into the original 1883 wooden door frame (which survives intact) and the existing door is not in keeping with the historic building. A new door to replace the existing would be preferable to leaving the existing. Any new door should be purpose made in wood with a glazed element and made to fill the original frame. The modern ‘period’ steel door proposed by the applicant would not be acceptable and approval should be refused.

Reason: The proposed door is not correctly sized to suit the existing opening, the material and design of the door are not sympathetic to the original 1883 building and would harm the architectural significance of the historic building.

Advisory: Detail drawings to a minimum scale of 1" to 1ft should be submitted for approval.

- 4.2 Double height lancet window to the Cayley Street (south) elevation:

Recommendation: Conditional approval should be given for the installation of new secondary external glazing to provide thermal upgrading.

Condition: Submission and approval of existing and proposed elevation drawings to a minimum scale of ¼" to 1ft and detail drawings to a minimum scale of 1½" to 1ft.

Reason: New thermal secondary glazing would improve the internal environment of the occupants.

- 4.3 Three lancet windows to west elevation:

Recommendation: The application to replace the windows should be refused approval.

Reason: The existing windows are the original 1883 surviving wooden double hung sash windows and as such represent an important and highly valuable architectural feature of the historic building. As a result, they should be retained.

Advisory: The illustration submitted by the applicant suggests the top sash of the windows would be retained and the bottom sash replaced with new a new opening vinyl window and mentions this is required for emergency means of escape. Drawn to scale detailed floor plans of the new internal layouts have not been seen so it has not been possible to comment on this proposed need.

1930s North Extension:

4.4 Alterations to the 1930s (?) north extension:

Recommendation: Conditional approval should be given subject to the following:

Conditions: As follows:

- Sample of new siding to be submitted and approved.
- Sample of new aluminum trim capping to windows to be submitted and approved.
- Existing and proposed floor plan and elevation drawings of the extension to minimum scale of ¼" to 1ft to be submitted and approved showing the proposed windows and doors, new steps and new deck. The west elevations should include the whole of the 1883 Chapel as well.

Reason: The proposed alterations would improve access to the building and the internal environment for the occupants.

1889 Church Building:

4.5 Windows to the north, east (Jackson Street) and south (Cayley Street) elevations:

Recommendation: Conditional approval should be given for the installation of new secondary external glazing to provide thermal upgrading.

Condition: Submission and approval of existing and proposed elevation drawings to a minimum scale of ¼" to 1ft and detail drawings to a minimum scale of 1½" to 1ft.

Reason: New thermal secondary glazing would improve the internal environment of the occupants.

Advisory: The applicant mentioned that the existing 1889 windows may need to be altered for means of escape. Proposals for this are not included in this application. Harmful alterations to these windows should be resisted and alternative options negotiated with the Chief Building Officer.

- 4.6 New hand railings to existing steps to the existing entrance door to Jackson Street (east) elevation:

Recommendation: Conditional approval should be given for the installation of new hand railings to the existing steps.

Condition: Submission and approval of existing and proposed elevation drawings to a minimum scale of ¼" to 1ft and detail drawings to a minimum scale of 1½" to 1ft.

Reason: New hand railings would improve the access and safety for occupants.

- 4.7 Existing entrance doors to the Cayley Street (south) elevation:

Recommendation: Conditional approval should be given to replace the existing door glazing with etched Christian Cross design, with new plain glazing.

Condition: Submission and approval of sample of new glazing.

Reason: The building is no longer a consecrated place of worship.

- 4.8 Existing steps to main Cayley Street entrance:

Recommendation: Conditional approval should be given for the construction of new steps and an access ramp.

Condition: Submission and approval of existing and proposed elevation drawings to a minimum scale of ¼" to 1ft and detail drawings to a minimum scale of 1½" to 1ft.

Reason: A new ramp would improve the access and safety for occupants.

- 4.9 New external lighting to Cayley Street (south) and west elevation:

Recommendation: The application to install new recessed lighting in the "soffits" should be refused approval.

Reason: This type of modern lighting would not be sympathetic with the architecture and the historic building.

Advisory: It is recognised that new lighting would improve access and safety for the occupants. The applicant should be encouraged to withdraw this part of the application and submit a new proposal for more appropriate types of light fittings.

- 4.10 **Advisory:** The external masonry exhibits areas of historic movement cracks and areas of inappropriate cement mortar pointing. The applicant should be encouraged to seek expert advice from an historic buildings specialist prior to carrying out any masonry repairs including crack repairs and repointing. Areas of inappropriate cement mortar pointing should be removed and the areas repointed in a suitable lime based mortar.