

Report to Council

Report Title: Cargill Community Hall Roof Path Forward

Prepared By: Colleen Gillis, Director of Community Services

Department: Recreation

Date: July 15, 2025

Report Number: REC2025-13 **File Number:** C11REC, R05

Attachments:

Recommendation:

That the Council of the Municipality of Brockton hereby receives Report Number REC2025-13, Cargill Community Hall Roof Path Forward, prepared by Colleen Gillis, Director of Community Services and in doing so directs staff to proceed with option _____ - as a path forward to repair Cargill Community Centre.

Report:

Background:

During the June 14, 2025, Closed Session of the Council Meeting staff were directed to provide a follow up report concerning the current state of the Cargill Community Centre roof. The initial overview highlighted significant structural issues that may threaten the roof's integrity if not addressed. To facilitate informed decision-making, the forthcoming report will provide an analysis of the roof's condition, accompanied by financial projections.

Timeline of Significant Events:

December 2024: Initial signs of roof leaks appeared in sporadic areas.

February 14, 2025: Severe leakages were observed at multiple locations within the Cargill Community Centre. Immediate action was taken to remove snow, uncovering pockets of water blocked by ice dams. The Municipal Insurance company was promptly contacted to initiate a claim.

March 2025: Following discussions with both the contractor and insurance provider's contractor, it was concluded that the current roof design would result in continued leaks. A scope of work and cost estimate of \$229,500 plus HST was submitted with insurance claim.

May 2025: The insurance provider approved coverage limited to fixing the existing design with financial assistance of \$38,352 HST included.

June 2025: A structural engineer was engaged to define specifications for potential bidders, ensuring compliance with the Purchasing & Procurement By-law. The service, including drawings and inspections, is valued at \$12,500 plus HST.

The Cargill District Community Foundation (CDCF) has pledged to donate \$100,000 over five years, contingent upon the completion of the roof reconstruction to address design flaws. Their ongoing dedication to the Cargill Community Centre underscores the value of securing a sustainable solution.

Analysis:

Staff have been working diligently with our insurance provided contractors, local roofing contractor and engineer to gain an understanding of roof design concerns and thorough assessments have been completed to ensure we move forward with this project in the most appropriate manner.

The Cargill Community Centre Hall was built in 1999 by a group of volunteers under the supervision of a local builder. The design structure of the hall was a common design build at that time meant for providing a space for community and family gatherings. Over the years the demand for use of this hall has continued to grow hosting not only weddings and social gatherings but large-scale fundraising events and recreational activities. The 26-year-old steel roof is near life cycle expectancy and will need major repairs or replacement in the next 5-10 years.

Discussions with CDCF members, insurance provided contractors and engineer concluded repairing to original state with building use during the winter heating season will continue to result in moderate continued ice damming and water leakage damage due to the existing roof design. The existing steel roof includes scrim insulation with an approximate R-20 value (at time of installation) and has no air ventilation between the insulation and steel roof. As there is no natural air ventilation of the steel roof and with only approximately R-20 insulation, when the building is heated any snow accumulation on the roof can result in ice damming on the roof. Properly naturally ventilated roofs provide for air flow from the eave to the peak of the roof to mitigate heat loss and prevents ice damming on a roof. The current R-20 insulation is a very thin layer of insulation that is not to the standard for heated buildings and is not cost efficient or effective for the operation of the mechanical heating and cooling system.

Insurance Coverage:

Insurance coverage includes cost to repair steel siding, fascia metal, eaves with hangers, downspouts, grommet screws to the amount of \$38,352 including HST. This coverage would repair the damage caused by the ice damming that occurred in February 2024 but would not result in a better state. Staff have prepared two options for Council to consider as a path forward for Cargill Community Centre roof repair:

Option 1: Repair existing roof as per insurance scope.

- Acknowledge potential for moderate ongoing leakage during winter when the building is heated due to existing roof design conditions. Potential risk for future unexpected closures.
- Encourage limiting winter operations to minimize future similar incidents. Proposed closure of hall during the months of January-March.
- No immediate budgetary impacts for 2025, but this does not address design inefficiencies long-term and may reduce year-round use of this facility.

- Roof will need to be replaced in 5-10 years and funding source will be decision to be made by future Council.
- Funds from CDCF will not be realized as there is no upgrade to the roof repair.

Option 2: Implement an engineered redesign of the roof

To upgrade insulation values, provide natural ventilation of the roof, a new standing seam steel roof, all of which will reduce future risks of ice damming and water damage/leaks. Additionally with the redesign of the existing roof, an option will be provided to alter the existing building eave design with structural steel work to extend the building eave to incorporate a new fascia. The structural steel work to extend the building eave would compliment and assist in the required scope of work to improve the existing building conditions.

- Substantial cost-saving through reduced operational hydro costs and potential future addition of air conditioning system to increase facility rentals.
- The existing roof is projected to reach the end of its operational lifespan within the next five to ten years. Funding contributions have been secured from the CDCF and insurance claim reimbursements. The use of these financial resources would be considered a proactive financial planning approach.
- Repairing roof now will reduce further interior damages.
- This option requires an up-front investment beyond current insurance coverage.

Estimated cost of project:

Item	Amount
Rough Estimate	\$250,000
Engineering Services including preparation of all tender/ construction drawings and specifications, review during construction.	\$12,500
Potential additional provisional costs	Up to \$100,000
Total Estimated Cost of Project	\$362,500 +HST
Less CDCF Funding	(\$100,000)
Less insurance monies	(\$38,352)
Estimate of Funding Required (including provisional items)	\$224,148

Next Steps Forward with Direction on New Roof:

1. Engagement of Engineer approved \$12,500
2. Project Scope Development: Engineer to define the full scope of the work with provisional options
3. Procurement Process:
 - Issue RFQ or RFQ, depending on estimated project value.
 - Tendering process- Mid August to Mid September
 - Receiving and evaluating submissions
 - Awarding contract- September 23, 2025, Council Meeting
4. Project Implementation: Project schedule will be developed in coordination with contractor. The timeline for project implementation will depend on supply of materials and weather conditions and is possible it could extend into spring of 2026.

Strategic Action Plan Checklist:

What aspect of the Brockton Strategic Action Plan does the content/recommendations in this report help advance?

- Recommendations help move the Municipality closer to its Vision Yes
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Heritage, Culture, and Community Yes
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Quality of Life Yes
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Land Use Planning and the Natural Environment N/A
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Economic Development N/A
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Municipal Governance N/A

Financial Impacts/Source of Funding:

- Do the recommendations represent a sound financial investment from a sustainability perspective?
N/A

Option 1: No 2025 budget impacts, limited winter operations would result in decreased revenue.

Option 2: Estimated Total Project Cost= \$362,500 +HST

Funding Summary:

Funding Source	Amount
Insurance Coverage	\$38,352
CDCF Contribution (over 5-year span)	\$100,000
Total External Funding Source	\$138,352
Estimated Remaining Funds Required	\$224,148

Funding Source Options:

Recreation Equipment Reserve – this reserve fund is for all recreational maintenance and replacement, for all facilities, parks, trails, pool, including equipment. With a balance of \$495,000.

Future Recreation Facility Reserve Fund: This reserve fund was established for the future replacement or rehabilitation of the Walkerton Community Centre/Arena. With a balance of \$1,525,000 – with \$800,000 is locked into long-term investment account.

Reviewed By:



Trish Serratore, Chief Financial Officer

Respectfully Submitted by:



Colleen Gillis, Director of Community Services

Reviewed By:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Sonya Watson", with a stylized flourish at the end.

Sonya Watson, Chief Administrative Officer