

Report to Council

Report Title:	Objections to Application to Repeal Designation on Henry Cargill White House		
Prepared By:	Sarah Johnson, Deputy Clerk and Fiona Hamilton, Director of Legislative and Legal Services (Clerk)		
Department:	Clerk's		
Date:	March 18, 2025		
Report Number:	CLK2025-05	File Number:	C11CL, R01
Attachments:	Notice of Application by Owners to Repeal Designation on Henry Cargill House Comments on Application to Repeal Designation By-Law		

Recommendation:

That the Council of the Municipality of Brockton hereby receives Report Number CLK2025-05 - Objections to Application to Repeal Designation on Henry Cargill White House, prepared by Sarah Johnson, Deputy Clerk and Fiona Hamilton, Director of Legislative and Legal Services (Clerk) and in doing so approves maintaining the heritage designation on the Henry Cargill "White" House thereby refusing the application to repeal the designation by-law, and further sending notices to the property owner, the individuals who objected, and the Ontario Heritage Trust as per the Ontario Heritage Act.

Report:

Background:

The Municipality of Brockton received a Notice of Application by Owner to Repeal the Designation By-Law under Section 32 of the Ontario Heritage Act for 12 Concession 10, Cargill, known as the Henry Cargill "White" House.

The Henry Cargill "White" House was formally designated as a heritage property in August 1988 by By-Law 88-15 with the former Township of Greenock. The Cargill "White" House is a monument to its original owner, Henry Cargill, who was the leading citizen of the village which come to bear his name. In its own right it is a unique and pleasing structure, a testament to the quality of late 19th century carpentry and millwork.

The Ontario Heritage Act requires that upon receiving the Application to Repeal the Designating By-Law, the Municipality shall publish a Notice of the Application in a newspaper having general circulation in the Municipality, containing a description of the property, statement of cultural heritage value and description of heritage attributes, statement that further information is available from the Municipality, and statement that Notice of Objection to the Application may be served on the Clerk within 30 days after the date of publication.

The Notice was dated January 15, 2025 and published in the Walkerton Herald Times and on the Municipality's website and social media accounts on January 23, 2025.

Any person could serve on the Municipal Clerk, a Notice of Objection, in writing, setting out the reasons for the objection and all relevant facts within 30 days from January 23, 2025, being Saturday, February 22, 2025. Any Notices of Objection are then considered by Council in its deliberation of the matter.

Analysis:

The Municipality received 8 Notices of Objection, from 6 residents, the President of Friends of Historic Cargill, and the Brockton Heritage Committee. Several comments were also made on social media from additional residents, although formal Notices of Objection did not follow.

Residents note their pride in the history of Cargill, including its founder Henry Cargill, who built the "White" House and encouraged the preservation of the designation. Of note, residents identified that the current owners of the property have repainted the property from its original white with green trim, to a teal colour. The property has been repainted since 2022, with no applications coming forward from the owners to restore the property to its original colours.

Since 2022, the Brockton Heritage Committee and Council have discussed this contravention of the By-Law which designated the property and its significance of being a "white" house. The Brockton Heritage Committee reminded the property owners of the Heritage Trust Fund Program By-Law, which offers loans and grants to designated heritage property owners. This matter was discussed several times over 2022 and 2023 in efforts to restore the property back to its original colouring, which has never been completed.

Former owners of the Henry Cargill "White" House, Cathy and Andy Cormack, provided their Notice of Objection summarizing the amount of work their family conducted to maintain the historic attributes of the property, noting its rich cultural history, which was featured in Ruth Cathcart's 1999 book, *The Architecture of a Provincial Society, Houses of Bruce County, Ontario 1850-1900*. The Cormack's further note the property's inclusion on former Doors Open events, and significant number of site visits, and provided several photographs of the property during their ownership, showing the maintenance of its heritage attributes.

The President of Friends of Historic Cargill, a community non-profit organization dedicated to preserving and celebrating the history, culture and beauty of Cargill submitted a Notice of Objection, noting the unique architecture of the property and importance of maintaining the heritage of Cargill, Brockton, and Bruce County as well as supporting local cultural tourism and community pride. Friends of Historic Cargill further mention the available grants for the property owner to restore and maintain the property.

The Brockton Heritage Committee formally passed the following resolution at their February 3, 2025 Meeting unanimously objecting the application to repeal the designation.

Resolution:

Moved by: Barb Kerry

Seconded by: Councillor Greg McLean

That the Brockton Heritage Committee rejects the notice of application by owners to repeal the designation on the Henry Cargill "White" House for the following reasons under Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act for determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest:

- The property has design value and physical value.
- The property has historical and associative value.
- The property has contextual value. It is a landmark (built in 1885-1890) in the Cargill municipality.

As well as the following significances:

1. The White House has unique local historical significance for the heritage of Cargill.
2. It assists in supporting local cultural and historical Tourism.
3. It supports Community pride in the heritage history of Cargill.
4. The White House is one of the oldest homes in Cargill.
5. The BHC provides loans and grants for restoration of Designated properties.

The Cargill White House was the first home built by Henry Cargill. It is a unique variation of the Queen Anne Revival style and contains many elements of the Stick style Architecture. This house is one of the very few Stick style houses remaining in Ontario, showing the quality of late 19th century carpentry and millwork. Previous owners have preserved the house's architectural style and history with great pride, care and consideration during their years of ownership

The main occupant of the White House in the early years was Henry's son Wellington D. Cargill. WD as he was known, took over the Cargill lumber business, after the untimely death of his father in 1903. In his retirement he lived at 17 Peter Street Walkerton.

The above are the reasons the Brockton Heritage Committee want to maintain the White House as a designated property in the Municipality of Brockton. It is an iconic home and the last remaining building of the Cargill dynasty in the late 18th and 19th centuries.

Carried.

The Henry Cargill "White" House is one of Brockton's first designated heritage properties. As the Municipality only has 11 designated heritage properties, the removal of this legacy property may set a poor example of how our Municipality values our heritage, especially as this is one of only two designated and listed properties located outside of the Town of Walkerton.

The Ontario Heritage Act requires that Council consider the application, and any objections served after consulting with the Municipal Heritage Committee and decide the following within 90 days after the end of the 30 day period (February 22, 2025):

1. Refuse the application and serve a Notice of Council's Decision on the property owner and any person who objected to the application.
2. Consent to the application and pass a by-law to repeal the designating by-law and send that repealing by-law to the property owner and any person who objected to the application, as well as publishing notice of Council's decision in a newspaper.

The property owner, and any person, can object to Council’s decision by appealing to the Tribunal within 30 days after receipt of Council’s Notice of Decision, setting out their objection to the decision and reasons in support of the objection, accompanied by a fee charged by the Tribunal.

Staff recommend maintaining the heritage designation on the Henry Cargill “White” House and seek Council’s direction on how they wish to proceed.

Strategic Action Plan Checklist:

What aspect of the Brockton Strategic Action Plan does the content/recommendations in this report help advance?

- Recommendations help move the Municipality closer to its Vision Yes
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Heritage, Culture, and Community Yes
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Quality of Life Yes
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Land Use Planning and the Natural Environment N/A
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Economic Development N/A
- Recommendations contribute to achieving Municipal Governance Yes

Financial Impacts/Source of Funding:

- Do the recommendations represent a sound financial investment from a sustainability perspective? Yes

The advertisement in the January 23, 2025 issue of the Walkerton Herald Times cost \$300 + HST.

There will be minimal costs associated with distributing Council’s decision to the property owner, individuals who objected to the application, and the Ontario Heritage Trust.

If Council’s decision is appealed to the Tribunal, additional costs are likely to arise.

Reviewed By:



Trish Serratore, Chief Financial Officer

Respectfully Submitted by:



Sarah Johnson, Deputy Clerk



Fiona Hamilton, Director of Legislative and Legal Services (Clerk)

Reviewed By:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Sonya Watson", with a long, sweeping flourish extending to the right.

Sonya Watson, Chief Administrative Officer